

# The supply chain governance model of apple and pear clubs: factors of success and failure in Belgium and The Netherlands?

LIEVENS, Eewoud\*; BONJEAN, Isabelle; MATHIJS, Erik

Division of Bioeconomics, Department of Earth and Environmental Sciences, University of Leuven, Belgium \*eewoud.lievens@kuleuven.be

## **MOTIVATION**

- Apple and pear clubs in BE and NL: examples of "collaborative supply chains" (Fearne, 1998; Leat and Revoredo-Giha, 2008)
- Collaboration both horizontally (among producers) and vertically (producerwholesaler)
- Goal: create differentiated goods as opposed to commodities
- Observed: both successes and failures

#### **Research question**

- Success factors for this type of collaborative supply chains?
  - Generalisation possible based on observed successes and failures?

## **CONTEXT**

- A & P farming in Belgium and The Netherlands: intensive, highly specialized
- A &P growers typically entrepreneurial and business-oriented
- Very high consolidation at initial wholesale level: cooperative auctions
- Strong dependency on export
  - + Market contraction since Russian embargo (2014)
- Loosing market share to Pink Lady®: foreign club apple variety

In search of commercial options

# A & P CLUBS

- Licensed production: pay royalties to patent holder
- Supply control: license holder controls planting of trees by growers
- Openness membership may vary (over time)
- Supply level based on market studies: upper market segment
- Branding
- Strict selection on quality: profit to grower depends on % accepted
- Some cases: price pooling (per size & quality class)
- Friction with food retailers' interests



# **Union of POs** Single PO **Private trader** BFV ✓ Price pooling License owner Wouters Fruit LTV E.F.C. (EU) X Price pooling ? Price pooling ✓ Price pooling Inova Fruit (NL) +/- Price pooling License franchisee BFV The Greenery Inova Fruit (NL) X Price pooling +/- Price pooling

## **FINDINGS**

## **Explorative empirical data on Belgium**

- 1. Focus groups and interviews to understand sales channels' (attributes)
- 2. Farmer survey: detailed farm- and farmer characteristics
- Little awareness by stakeholders on control & coordination differences: understood as one "governance model"
- > Much confusion on success and failure of apple and pear clubs

## Secondary data on The Netherlands (e.g. thesis Hoffmans, 2012)

Cases of failure more common, and wider recognition by stakeholders





The authors gratefully acknowledge the funding from the European Union's Horizon 2020 research and innovation programme under grant agreement No 635577

# **NEXT STEPS**

- Suitable conceptual framework for assessing this type of supply chain collaboration?
  - Meaningful typology of apple and pear clubs
- Expand empirical data collection to The Netherlands